

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC<br/>REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS<br/>LIABILITY LITIGATION</b> | <b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327<br/>MDL No. 2327</b> |
| <b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO<br/>THE CASES ON THE EXHIBITS<br/>ATTACHED HERETO</b>       | <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN<br/>U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>      |

**JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS WITHOUT PREJUDICE**

Plaintiffs, whose cases are listed on the attached Exhibits A - M, and Defendants, Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc. and/or Ethicon LLC (collectively, the “Ethicon Defendants”), jointly move to dismiss without prejudice all claims against the Ethicon Defendants, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2). No other defendants remain. Therefore, the Ethicon Defendants respectfully request the Court close this case and strike it from the docket. Each party shall bear her or its own costs.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Laura J. Baughman

Laura J. Baughman  
Baron & Budd  
3102 Oak Lawn Avenue  
Suite 1100  
Dallas, TX 75219  
(214) 521-3605  
lbaughman@baronbudd.com

/s/ Mathew Coveney

Mathew Coveney  
Coveney Law  
1075 Main Street  
3rd Floor  
Waltham, MA 02451

/s/ William M. Gage

William M. Gage (MS Bar #8691)  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4561  
william.gage@butlersnow.com

/s/ Susan M. Robinson

Susan M. Robinson (W. Va. Bar #5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)

(508) 449-4228  
mcoveney@unitedlawteam.com

/s/ Mary Elizabeth Graham  
Mary Elizabeth Graham  
Grant & Eisenhofer  
123 South Justison Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 622-7110  
egraham@gelaw.com

/s/ Lisa Ann Gorshe  
Lisa Ann Gorshe  
Johnson Becker  
33 South Sixth Street  
Suite 4530  
Minneapolis, MN 55402  
(612) 436-1800  
lgorshe@johnsonbecker.com

/s/ Sean Michael Cleary  
Sean Michael Cleary  
Law Offices of Sean M. Cleary  
19 West Flagler Street  
Suite 618  
Miami, FL 33130  
(305) 416-9805  
sean@clearypa.com

/s/ Yvonne M. Flaherty  
Yvonne M. Flaherty  
Lockridge Grindal Nauen  
100 Washington Avenue South  
Suite 2200  
Minneapolis, MN 55401  
(612) 339-6900  
ymflaherty@locklaw.com

/s/ Marc Stanley Whitehead  
Marc Stanley Whitehead  
Marc Whitehead & Associates  
5300 Memorial Drive  
Suite 725  
Houston, TX 77007  
(713) 228-8888  
marc@marcwhitehead.com

P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 24338  
(304) 414-1800  
srobinson@tcspllc.com  
*Counsel for the Ethicon Defendants*

/s/ Alan S. Lazar

Alan S. Lazar  
Marlin & Saltzman  
29229 Canwood Street  
Suite 208  
Agoura Hills, CA 91301  
(818) 991-8080  
alazar@marlinsaltzman.com

/s/ Donald A. Migliori

Donald A. Migliori  
Motley Rice  
321 South Main Street  
Suite 200  
Providence, RI 02903  
(401) 457-7700  
dmigliori@motleyrice.com

/s/ Alyson Oliver

Alyson Oliver  
Oliver Law Group  
950 West University Drive  
Suite 200  
Rochester, MI 48307  
(248) 327-6556  
aoliver@oliverlg.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Glassman

Jeffrey S. Glassman  
The Law Offices of Jeffrey S. Glassman  
One Beacon Street  
Suite 3333  
Boston, MA 02108  
(617) 367-9999  
jsg@jeffreysglassman.com

/s/ John G. Simon

John G. Simon  
Amy Collignon Gunn  
The Simon Law Firm  
800 Market Street  
Suite 1700  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
(314) 241-2929  
jisimon@simonlawpc.com  
agunn@simonlawpc.com

/s/ Amy Collignon Gunn  
Amy Collignon Gunn  
The Simon Law Firm  
800 Market Street  
Suite 1700  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
(314) 241-2929  
agunn@simonlawpc.com

/s/ Erin M. Wood  
Erin M. Wood  
Waters & Kraus  
3141 Hood Street  
Suite 700  
Dallas, TX 75219  
(214) 357-6244  
ewood@waterskraus.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on this date I electronically filed this document with the clerk of the court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of this filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ William M. Gage

**EXHIBIT A**  
**(Baron & Budd)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>   |
|--------------------------------|--|
| 2:15-cv-05901                  | Debra Norris and Robert Norris v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:17-cv-01815                  | Amanda Moore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |

**EXHIBIT B**  
**(Coveney Law)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>                                  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:16-cv-12230                  | Deborah Pearson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:16-cv-12233                  | Patricia H. Tomberlin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |

**EXHIBIT C**  
**(Grant & Eisenhofer)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>                               |
|--------------------------------|--|
| 2:18-cv-00375                  | Marie E. Goodgame v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:18-cv-00383                  | Melanie T. Gallian v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |

**EXHIBIT D**  
**(Johnson Becker)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:13-cv-33879                  | Melissa Shellnut and John Shellnut v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson;<br>Ethicon, LLC |
| 2:16-cv-01868                  | Irene E. Borland v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |



**EXHIBIT E**  
**(Law Offices of Sean M. Cleary)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>                                      |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-11757                  | Donna Myers v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson |

**EXHIBIT F**  
**(Lockridge Grindal Nauen)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-29017                  | Eudene Hood v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:17-cv-02806                  | Stacie Young and Steven Young v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |

**EXHIBIT G**  
**(Marc Whitehead & Associates)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>                                    |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:16-cv-11635                  | Tammy Ash v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson               |
| 2:16-cv-11636                  | Cheryl Camille Casebolt v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:16-cv-11752                  | Angie Montejano v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson         |

**EXHIBIT H**  
**(Marlin & Saltzman)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:13-cv-01981                  | Sharon Jackson and Robert Jackson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:15-cv-07478                  | Gloria Boothe v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |

**EXHIBIT I**  
**(Motley Rice)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:17-cv-00953                  | Esther L. Ramos v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:14-cv-05276                  | Barbara Sprague and Thomas Sprague v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson;<br>Ethicon, LLC |

**EXHIBIT J**  
**(Oliver Law Group)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:17-cv-03702                  | Kimberly Grimsic and Steven Grimsic v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |

**EXHIBIT K**  
**(The Law Offices of Jeffrey S. Glassman)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:14-cv-27244                  | Pamela Travers and Joseph Travers v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:15-cv-07434                  | Mary Teague and Thomas Teague v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson     |

**EXHIBIT L**  
**(The Simon Law Firm)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>  |
|--------------------------------|---|
| 2:17-cv-01100                  | Elyece Paholke and Herold Paholke v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:17-cv-04585                  | Vickey Engel v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |



**EXHIBIT M**  
**(Waters & Kraus)**

| <b><u>Civil Action No.</u></b> | <b><u>Case Style</u></b>   |
|--------------------------------|--|
| 2:14-cv-02162                  | Anna Marie Holmes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, LLC    |
| 2:18-cv-01024                  | Christina Winters and Rick Winters v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |